

THE GILDER LEHRMAN INSTITUTE *of* AMERICAN HISTORY

David McCullough Essay Prizes Rubrics

Category 1: Research Essay

Score of 5:

1. Presents a historically defensible claim
2. Supports and strengthens the claim by using diverse evidence
3. Emphasizes analysis over description, involving the evaluation, creation, and examination of information
4. Uses historical reasoning to explain how different pieces of evidence are connected or related
5. Provides rich support for the claim with numerous relevant facts, examples, and details
6. Demonstrates a logical and clear organizational plan
7. Concludes with insights that go beyond merely restating the initial claim
8. Incorporates relevant information from at least one primary source dating from 1491 to 2001 and at least one secondary source
9. Establishes a direct connection between the primary and secondary source(s) and the main claim
10. Cites primary and secondary source(s) consistently throughout and includes them in a bibliography
11. Adheres to a suggested word count of 1,500–2,500 words (approximately 6 pages)

Score of 4:

1. Presents a historically defensible claim
2. Supports and strengthens the claim with evidence
3. Includes analysis and description involving the evaluation, creation, and examination of information
4. Uses historical reasoning to explain how different pieces of evidence are connected or related
5. Provides support for the claim with relevant facts, examples, and details
6. Demonstrates a logical and clear organizational plan
7. Concludes with insights that go beyond merely restating the initial claim
8. Incorporates information from at least one primary source dating from 1491 to 2001 and at least one secondary source
9. Establishes a connection between the primary and secondary source(s) and the main claim
10. Cites primary and secondary source(s) consistently throughout and includes them in a bibliography
11. Adheres to a suggested word count of 1,500–2,500 words (approximately 6 pages).

Score of 3:

1. Presents a historically defensible claim
2. Supports and strengthens the claim with evidence
3. Is more descriptive than analytical (may apply, analyze, and/or evaluate information)
4. Uses some historical reasoning to explain different pieces of evidence

5. Provides some support for the claim with relevant facts, examples, and details; may include some minor inaccuracies
6. Demonstrates an organizational plan
7. Concludes with a brief restatement of the claim of the essay
8. Incorporates information from at least one primary source dating from 1491 to 2001 and at least one secondary source
9. Cites primary and secondary source(s) consistently throughout and includes them in a bibliography
10. Adheres to a suggested word count of 1,500–2,500 words (approximately 6 pages)

Score of 2:

1. Presents a historically defensible claim
2. Is primarily descriptive; may include faulty, weak, or isolated analysis
3. Uses some historical reasoning to explain different pieces of evidence
4. Provides some support for the claim with relevant facts, examples, and details; may include some minor inaccuracies
5. Demonstrates a general organizational plan; may lack focus or include digressions
6. Concludes with a brief restatement of the claim of the essay
7. Incorporates information from at least one primary source dating from 1491 to 2001 and at least one secondary source
8. Cites primary and secondary source(s) unevenly throughout and includes them in a bibliography that may be incomplete (e.g., omitting title, author, and/or date), but may not include all sources cited and may be in an inconsistent format
9. Adheres to a suggested word count of 1,500–2,500 words (approximately 6 pages)

Score of 1:

1. Presents a weak historical claim
2. Is descriptive; may lack understanding of the topic and does not explain different pieces of evidence
3. Provides minor support for the claim with facts, examples, and details; may include inaccuracies
4. Demonstrates a weak organizational plan; may lack an introduction or a conclusion
5. Incorporates information from at least one primary source dating from 1491 to 2001 and at least one secondary source
6. Citations and/or bibliography noting primary and secondary sources may be missing entirely
7. Adheres to a suggested word count of 1,500–2,500 words (approximately 6 pages)